

# United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

| APPLICATION NO.        | FILING DATE               | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.  | CONFIRMATION NO. |
|------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------------|
| 10/789,103             | 02/27/2004                | Qingguo Wu           | NOVLP094/NVLS-002919 | 7687             |
| 22434<br>BEYER WEAV    | 7590 01/24/200<br>/ER LLP |                      | EXAMINER             |                  |
| P.O. BOX 7025          | 50                        |                      | CHEN, BRET P         |                  |
| OAKLAND, CA 94612-0250 |                           | ·                    | ART UNIT             | PAPER NUMBER     |
|                        |                           | •                    | 1762                 |                  |
|                        |                           |                      |                      |                  |
| SHORTENED STATUTORY    | Y PERIOD OF RESPONSE      | MAIL DATE            | DELIVERY MODE        |                  |
| 3 MOI                  | NTHS                      | 01/24/2007           | PAI                  | PER              |

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire 6 MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.

|  | Application No.  | Applicant(s)   |   |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| ·  | 10/789,103   | WU ET AL.  | • |  |  |  |  |
| Office Action Summary  | Examiner   | Art Unit   |   |  |  |  |  |
|  | B. Chen  | 1762   |   |  |  |  |  |
| The MAILING DATE of this communication app   | ears on the cover sheet with the c   | orrespondence address  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Period for Reply   |  |  | • |  |  |  |  |
| A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DA  - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.13 after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period w  - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b). | TE OF THIS COMMUNICATION 6(a). In no event, however, may a reply be tim Ill apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from cause the application to become ABANDONE | I. lely filed the mailing date of this communication. (35 U.S.C. § 133). |   |  |  |  |  |
| Status   |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 14 No.  | vember 2006.   |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| , ——   | action is non-final.   | •  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the   |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| closed in accordance with the practice under E.  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Disposition of Claims  |  | ·  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 4) Claim(s) <u>1-12,15-33,45 and 49-51</u> is/are pendir   | ng in the application.   | •  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdraw  | n from consideration.  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 5) Claim(s) is/are allowed.  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 6)⊠ Claim(s) <u>1-12,15-33,45 and 49-51</u> is/are rejected.   |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 7) Claim(s) is/are objected to.  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 8) Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/or  | election requirement.  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Application Papers   |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 10) The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) acce  | pted or b) objected to by the f  | Examiner.  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Applicant may not request that any objection to the o  | Irawing(s) be held in abeyance. See  | e 37 CFR 1.85(a).  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correcti  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 11)☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Exa   | aminer. Note the attached Office   | Action or form PTO-152.  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119   |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign a) All b) Some * c) None of:   | priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)  | -(d) or (f).   |   |  |  |  |  |
| <ol> <li>Certified copies of the priority documents</li> </ol>   | have been received.  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 2. Certified copies of the priority documents  | have been received in Applicati  | on No  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 3. Copies of the certified copies of the prior   | •  | ed in this National Stage  |   |  |  |  |  |
| application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).  |  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of  | of the certified copies not receive  | d.   |   |  |  |  |  |
|  | •  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Attachment(s)  | _  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) 2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)  | 4) Interview Summary<br>Paper No(s)/Mail Da  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| 2)   | 5) 🔲 Notice of Informal P  |  |   |  |  |  |  |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date  | 6) Other:  |  |   |  |  |  |  |

Application/Control Number: 10/789,103

Art Unit: 1762

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

Claims 1-12, 15-33, 45, and 49-51 are pending in this application, which is an RCE of Serial Number 10/789103.

The amendment after final dated 8/14/06, previously unentered, has now been entered in the application. Amended claims 1, 29, 45 and canceled claims 13-14, 47-48 are noted.

#### Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114

A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on 11/14/06 has been entered.

## **Double Patenting**

The nonstatutory double patenting rejection is based on a judicially created doctrine grounded in public policy (a policy reflected in the statute) so as to prevent the unjustified or improper timewise extension of the "right to exclude" granted by a patent and to prevent possible harassment by multiple assignees. A nonstatutory obviousness-type double patenting rejection is appropriate where the conflicting claims are not identical, but at least one examined application claim is not patentably distinct from the reference claim(s) because the examined application claim is either anticipated by, or would have been obvious over, the reference claim(s). See, e.g., *In re Berg*, 140 F.3d 1428, 46 USPQ2d 1226 (Fed. Cir. 1998); *In re Goodman*, 11 F.3d 1046, 29 USPQ2d 2010 (Fed. Cir. 1993); *In re Longi*, 759 F.2d 887, 225 USPQ 645 (Fed. Cir. 1985); *In re Van Ornum*, 686 F.2d 937, 214 USPQ 761 (CCPA 1982); *In re Vogel*, 422 F.2d 438, 164 USPQ 619 (CCPA 1970); and *In re Thorington*, 418 F.2d 528, 163 USPQ 644 (CCPA 1969).

A timely filed terminal disclaimer in compliance with 37 CFR 1.321(c) or 1.321(d) may be used to overcome an actual or provisional rejection based on a nonstatutory double patenting ground provided the conflicting application or patent either is shown to be commonly owned

Art Unit: 1762

with this application, or claims an invention made as a result of activities undertaken within the scope of a joint research agreement.

Effective January 1, 1994, a registered attorney or agent of record may sign a terminal disclaimer. A terminal disclaimer signed by the assignee must fully comply with 37 CFR 3.73(b).

Claims 1-12, 15-33, 45, and 49-51 are provisionally rejected on the ground of nonstatutory obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-27 of copending Application No. 10/800409. Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because changing the precursor is an obvious variation.

This is a provisional obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

Claims 1-12, 15-33, 45, and 49-51 are provisionally rejected on the ground of nonstatutory obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over claims 1-31 of copending Application No. 10/820525. Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other because the elimination of a plasma is an obvious variation.

This is a provisional obviousness-type double patenting rejection because the conflicting claims have not in fact been patented.

Application/Control Number: 10/789,103

Art Unit: 1762

### Response to Arguments

Applicant's arguments filed 8/14/06 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

It is noted that the applicant has indicated that they would files a terminal disclaimer if the claims were indicated allowable (p.8 last paragraph).

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to B. Chen whose telephone number is (571) 272-1417. The examiner can normally be reached on 7:30am - 4:00pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Timothy Meeks can be reached on (571) 272-1423. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

Bc 1/21/07

BRET CHEN PRIMARY EXAMINER